# Interpreting Scriptures in Judaism, Christianity and Islam: Overlapping Inquiries ed. Mordechai Z. Cohen and Adele Berlin (Cambridge University Press, 2016)

## Chapter List

Introduction Intersecting encounters with scriptures in three faiths, Mordechai Cohen

## Part I Scriptural texts in changing contexts

- 1. The emergence of biblical interpretation in antiquity, *James Kugel*
- 2. Disclosing the mystery: hermeneutics of typology in Syriac exegesis, Sidney Griffith
- 3. "We have made it an Arabic Qur'an": the permissibility of translating scripture in Islam in contrast with Judaism and Christianity, *Meir Bar-Asher*
- 4. The unmoved mover begins to move: literary and artistic renderings of the Christian Bible, *Piero Boitani*
- 5. Deconstructing the dual Torah: a Jewish response to the Muslim model of scripture, *Meira Polliack*

## Part II Conceptions of the literal sense

- 6. The literal sense of Christian scripture: redefinition and revolution, *Jon Whitman*
- 7. Figuring the letter: making sense of the *sensus litteralis* in late-medieval Christian exegesis, *Alastair Minnis*
- 8. Conceptions of the literal sense (ḥaqīqa, zāhir) in Muslim interpretive thought, *Robert Gleave*
- 9. Emergence of the rule of *peshat* in Jewish Bible exegesis, *Mordechai Cohen*

## Part III Rhetoric and the poetics of reading

- 10. Poetry and commentary in the medieval school of Rheims: reading Virgil, reading David, *A. B. Kraebel*
- 11. On the figurative (*majāz*) in Muslim interpretation and legal hermeneutics, *Wolfhart Heinrichs*
- 12. Words of eloquence: rhetoric and poetics in Jewish *peshat* exegesis in its Muslim and Christian contexts, *Mordechai Cohen*
- 13. Classical rhetoric and scriptural interpretation in the Latin West, Rita Copeland
- 14. Robert Lowth's biblical poetics and Romantic theory, Stephen Prickett
- 15. From scripture to literature: modern ways of reading the Bible, Adele Berlin

#### LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

**Meir M. Bar-Asher** is Max Schloessinger Professor of Islamic Studies and the chair of the Department of Arabic Language and Literature at The Hebrew University of Jerusalem. His research interests include the Qur'an and its exegesis, Muslim sectarianism, and the interaction between Judaism and Islam. Among his published works are *Scripture and Exegesis in Early Imāmī-Shiism* (1999) and *The Nuṣayrī-'Alawī religion: an enquiry into its theology and liturgy* (2002, with Aryeh Kofsky).

**Adele Berlin** is Robert H. Smith Professor of Hebrew Bible Emerita in the Department of English and the Jewish Studies Program at University of Maryland. Her research interests include literary study of the Bible, inner-biblical and ancient Jewish interpretation, and modern interpretive strategies. Among her publications are *Poetics and Interpretation of Biblical Narrative* (1983), *The Dynamics of Biblical Parallelism* (1985), and *The JPS Bible Commentary: Esther* (2001).

**Piero Boitani** is Professor of Comparative Literature and Head of the Department of Modern Languages, Literatures and Cultures at the University of Rome, "La Sapienza." His research interests include the Bible and its re-writings in European literature and art; Dante, Boccaccio, and Chaucer; and thirteenth- and fourteenth-century English narrative. Among his published works are *The Bible and Its Rewritings* (1999), *The Cambridge Chaucer Companion* (1986, edited with Jill Mann), and *English medieval narrative in the thirteenth and fourteenth centuries* (1982).

Mordechai Z. Cohen is Professor of Bible and Associate Dean of the Bernard Revel Graduate School of Jewish Studies, Yeshiva University. His research interests include medieval Jewish Bible interpretation in Christian and Muslim cultural contexts; connections with Arabic poetics and Hebrew poetry; medieval Jewish legal hermeneutics and Muslim jurisprudence; and modern literary approaches to the Bible. Among his published works are *Three Approaches to Biblical Metaphor: From Abraham Ibn Ezra and Maimonides to David Kimhi* (2003) and *Opening the Gates of Interpretation: Maimonides' Biblical Hermeneutics in Light of His Geonic-Andalusian Heritage and Muslim Milieu* (2011).

**Rita Copeland** is Sheli Z. and Burton X. Rosenberg Professor of Humanities at the University of Pennsylvania, and a member of the departments of Classical Studies and English. Her research interests include medieval literary history, rhetoric, and hermeneutics as applied to Bible and literary culture, Latin receptions of Greek and Arabic learning, and scriptural interpretation among heretical groups (Wycliffites / Lollards). Among her publications are *Rhetoric, Hermeneutics, and Translation in the Middle Ages* (1991), *The Cambridge Companion to Allegory* (2010, edited with Peter T. Struck), and *Medieval Grammar and Rhetoric: Language Arts and Literary Theory, AD 300 - 1475* (2009, with Ineke Sluiter).

**Robert M. Gleave** is Professor of Islamic and Arabic Studies at the University of Exeter. His research interests include Islamic Law and legal theory (*usūl al-fiqh*); Muslim theories of interpretation; Shi'ite legal, political, and hermeneutical theory; Medieval Arabic literature and literary theory. Among his published books are *Scripturalist Islam: The History and Doctrines of the Akhbari School of Shii Thought* (2007) and *Islam and Literalism: Literal Meaning and Interpretation in Islamic Legal Theory* (2012).

**Sidney H. Griffith** is Ordinary Professor Emeritus of Semitic Languages at The Catholic University of America. His research interests include Syriac Christian Bible interpretation, early Arabic Bible translations, and their influences on the Qur'an and its interpretation. Among his publications are *Faith Adoring the Mystery Reading the Bible with St. Ephraem the Syrian* (1997), *The Church in the Shadow of the Mosque: Christians and Muslims in the World of Islam* (2008), and *The Bible in Arabic: The Scriptures of the "People of the Book" in the Language of Islam* (2013).

†Wolfhart P. Heinrichs was James Richard Jewett Professor of Arabic at Harvard University. His research interests were medieval Arabic literary theory, Islamic legal hermeneutics, the notion of *majâz* ("figurative speech") in Arabic poetics and qur'anic hermeneutics, and Neo-Aramaic. Among his books are *Arabische Dichtung und griechische Poetik: Hāzim al-Qartāğannīs Grundlegung d. Poetik mit Hilfe aristotel Begriffe* (1969), *The Hand of the Northwind: Opinions on Metaphor and the Early Meaning of Isti 'āra in Arabic Poetics* (1977), and *Studies in Neo-Aramaic* (1990).

**A. B. Kraebel** is Assistant Professor of English at Trinity University. His research focuses on medieval interpretation of the Bible and classical Latin literature, as well as book history and manuscript studies. He has published an edition of The Sermons of William of Newburgh (2010), and he is currently preparing a monograph, tentatively entitled *The Appeal of the Academic: Biblical Commentary and Translation in Late Medieval England*.

**James L. Kugel** is Professor of Bible at Bar-Ilan University and Director of the Institute for the History of the Jewish Bible at Bar-Ilan University. His research interests include the "interpreted" Bible, as reflected in the Dead Sea Scrolls, rabbinic literature, New Testament, and Qur'an; liturgical uses of Scripture; biblical poetry and the notion of parallelism as interpreted from ancient to modern times. Among his publications are *The Idea of Biblical Poetry: Parallelism and Its History* (1981); *The Bible as It Was* (1997); and *How to Read the Bible: A Guide to Scripture, Then and Now* (2007).

Alastair J. Minnis is Douglas Tracy Smith Professor of English at Yale University. His research interests include medieval literary theory and notions of authorship; medieval study of the Bible and classical literature; conceptions of Scripture's multiple senses; scholasticism and its vernacular intersections. Among his published writings are *Medieval Holy Women in the Christian Tradition C. 1100-C. 1500* (2010; edited with Rosalynn Voaden); *Translations of Authority in Medieval English Literature: Valuing the Vernacular* (2009); and *Medieval Theory of Authorship: Scholastic Literary Attitudes in the Later Middle Ages* (1984).

Meira Polliack is Professor of Biblical Studies at Tel-Aviv University. Her research interests include medieval Bible exegesis and translation, Karaism, Judaeo-Arabic Literature, and Judaeo-Arabic sources in the Cairo Genizah; reception history and interpretation of the Bible as a central feature of the cultural history of the Jews of the medieval Islamic world. She has written *The Karaite Tradition of Arabic Bible Translation: A Linguistic and Exegetical Study of Karaite Translations of the Pentateuch from the Tenth and Eleventh Centuries C.E.* (1997) and edited *Karaite Judaism: A Guide to Its History and Literary Sources* (2003).

**Stephen Prickett** is Regius Professor Emeritus of English Language and Literature, University of Glasgow, and Honorary Professor of the University of Kent at Canterbury. His research interests include literature, theology, and history of biblical interpretation in the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries; and romantic appropriations of scripture. Among his publications are *Words and the Word: Language, Poetics, and Biblical Interpretation* (1986); *Origins of Narrative The Romantic Appropriation of the Bible* (1996); and *Modernity and the Reinvention of Tradition: Backing into the Future* (2009).

Jon Whitman is Associate Professor in the Department of English of The Hebrew University of Jerusalem, where for many years he also served as Director of The Center for Literary Studies. His research interests include interpretive and literary allegory; diverse conceptions of the "literal" sense; changing approaches to relations between Scripture and literature; the development of medieval romance; imaginative structures of history and time; and critical theory from antiquity to the modern period. He is the author of Allegory: The Dynamics of an Ancient and Medieval Technique (1987) and the editor of Interpretation and Allegory: Antiquity to the Modern Period (2000) and Romance and History: Imagining Time from the Medieval to the Early Modern Period (2015).

## MEDIEVAL RABBANITE SCHOOLS OF BIBLE INTERPRETATION

GEONIC-ANDALUSIAN	NORTHERN FRENCH
SAADIA GAON	Mídrashíc ínterpretatíon and compílatíons
Bible exegete, philosopher; Egypt, Iraq; 882-942	
SAMUEL BEN HOFNI GAON (Bible exegete, philosopher; Iraq; d. 1013)	
JUDAH HAYYUJ (seminal Hebrew linguist; al-Andalus, late 10 <sup>th</sup> century)	
JONAH IBN JANAH (linguist; al-Andalus, early 11 <sup>th</sup> cent.)	
MOSES IBN CHIQUITILLA	
al-Andalus, late 11th century, linguist, Bible exegete	
JUDAH IBN BAL'AM	
al-Andalus, late 11 <sup>th</sup> century, linguist, Bible exegete	
MOSES IBN EZRA	RASHI (Solomon b. Isaac)
c. 1055-1138; al-Andalus' Literary critic, poet, philosopher	1040-1105; Troyes; Bible exegete, talmudist
JUDAH HA-LEVI	Compare with Rashi: Bruno of Cologne
1070-1141; Christian Spain, Israel	(1030-1101), master at the Rheims Cathedral
Poet (protégé of Moses Ibn Ezra), philosopher	school (c. 1060-1080), founder of the
	Carthusían Monastíc order (c. 1084)
ABRAHAM IBN EZRA	RASHBAM (Samuel b. Meir)
1089-1164; Spain, Italy, France, England	c. 1080-1160 (Rashi's grandson)
Linguist, Bible exegete, translator of scientific texts	Bible exegete, talmudist
MOSES MAIMONIDES	Compare with Rashi, Rashbam: 12th century
1138-1204; al-Andalus, Egypt	Latín Bíble interpreters, Hugh and
Talmudist, philosopher	Andrew of St. Victor (outside of Paris)
Inheritors of the two schools:	
DAVID KIMHI (RADAK)	
c. 1160-1235; Provence (son of Joseph Kimhi), Linguist, Bible exegete	
MOSES NAHMANIDES (RAMBAN)	
1194-270; Christian Spain, Talmudist, Bible exegete, Kabbalist	

#### Sources in the Commentators

- 1. Maimonides on Christian interpretation, Mishneh Torah. Jesus of Nazareth and the Ishmaelite [Muhammad] who arose after him... cleared the way for the Messiah-King, to prepare the entire world to worship the Lord together... Because of them, the... the Torah and the 613 commandments are well known in the entire world, and these matters have spread in the distant isles and among many peoples of uncircumcised heart. And people discuss and debate these matters and the commandments of the Torah, some saying: "These commandments were true, but they are void today and were not applicable eternally." And some say: "There is a hidden meaning to them and they are not to be taken according to their literal sense, and the Messiah has come and revealed their hidden meanings."
- **2. Moses Ibn Ezra,** *Poetics*. In my youth, in my hometown, a Muslim scholar... asked me to recite the Ten Commandments in Arabic. I understood his intention, to demonstrate the paucity of its rhetoric. I therefore asked him to recite the opening (*al-fatiha*) of his Qur'an in Latin... but when he set out to translate it into that language its words became ugly and its beauty tarnished. He understood my intention and released me from his request.

## 3. Robert Lowth (1710-1787), On the Sacred Poetry of the Hebrews.

#### I. Synonymous Parallelism:

When Israel went out from Egypt / The house of Jacob from a strange people

Judah was as his sacred heritage / Israel his dominion.

The sea saw, and fled / Jordan turned back

The mountains leaped like rams / The hills like the sons of the flock.

What ailed thee, O Sea, that thou fleddest / Jordan, that thou turnedst back?

Mountains, that ye leaped like rams / And hills, like the sons of the flock?

At the presence of the Lord tremble thou Earth / At the presence of the God of Jacob!

Who turned the rock into a lake of waters / The flint into a water spring. (Psalm 114)

#### **II.** Antithetic parallelism ("when a thing is illustrated by its contrary being opposed to it"):

The cloyed will trample upon an honey-comb

But to the hungry every bitter thing is sweet. (Prov 27:6–7)

There is who maketh himself rich, and wanteth all things

Who maketh himself poor, yet hath much wealth. (Prov 13:7)

The rich man is wise in his own eyes

But the poor man that hath discernment to trace him out will despise him. (Prov 28:11)

#### III. Synthetic parallelism ("the sentences answer to each other... by the form of construction")

The law of The Lord is perfect, restoring the soul;

The testimony of The Lord is sure, making wise the simple;

The precepts of The Lord are right, rejoicing the heart;

The commandment of The Lord is clear, enlightening the eyes (Psalms 19:8–9)

**General observation about parallelism:** The poetical conformation of the sentences... characteristic of the Hebrew poetry, consists chiefly in a certain equality, resemblance, or parallelism between the members of each period; so that in two lines (or members of the same period) things for the most part shall answer to things, and words to words, as if fitted to each other by a kind of rule or measure.

- **4. Rashi on Genesis 3:8**. There are many midrashic *aggadot* and our Rabbis have already arranged them in their appropriate place in *Genesis Rabbah*. But my aim is to relate only the *peshat* of Scripture and the *aggadah* that settles (*meyashevet*) the words of Scripture... "each word in its proper place" (Prov 25:11).
- **5. Abraham Ibn Ezra on Rashi's commentary**. Our early Sages... said: "A biblical verse does not leave the realm of its *peshat*," whereas *derash* is an added idea. But later generations made *derash* fundamental, like Rabbi Solomon of blessed memory, who interpreted Scripture by way of *derash*. He thought that his commentary is *peshat*, but in fact the *peshat* in his work is less than one in a thousand. Yet the sages of our generation celebrate these books.

## 6. Bruno the Carthusian, Psalms Commentary

On Psalm 77 (MT 78). Narrating the former benefits God bestowed upon their fathers in ancient times, the beginning of this psalm adjures the same less perfect Asaph that he attentively and diligently hear the things which are said to him in "parables" and "propositions," i.e., that he understand those benefits mystically, not so much according to the letter, as their incredulous fathers did, who neglected them and, understanding only the letter, perished. Therefore he narrates those benefits to teach them history, in so far as these things happened to an earlier people, and to teach them in figures, in so far as these things likewise come to pass in the Church.

Although this psalm, which is to be read continuously for its history (*continuatim juxta historiam*), contains within it an allegory (*allegoriam*), it does not everywhere contain an allegory that can be read continuously (*juxta allegoriam continuatim*)... This psalm, like the rest [of the Psalms], contains prophecy, although not when it is read historically (*ad historiam*).

...thus should all the rest of the benefits, all the way to the end of the psalm, be read according to the letter, and we will expound all of these things continuously (*continue*) according to the letter in their proper place. But since allegories appear to be contained in individual events, it seems best to expound the individual allegorical mysteries one at a time, either to avoid tedium, or because the allegory is difficult, or because it would be impossible to read the psalm continuously according to these allegories.

Regarding the "mystical reading" of Psalm 50 (MT 51): In this history a figure is involved (continetur), which, even though it does not appear to pertain to the intention of this psalm, still has something useful to offer to the audience.

Regarding Psalm 141 (MT 142): The allegory of this history, not altogether worth pursuing, is as follows...

Regarding Ps 97:3 (MT 98:3), "All the ends of the earth have seen the salvation of our God" — ...or this can be read allegorically [allegorice legi]:... the ends of the earth, that is, all those who restrain their earthly qualities... Yet, according to the letter (ad litteram), what follows (sequentia) seems to accord better with the earlier meaning (priori sententiae).