
SCHOLARLY MAN OF FAITH

Studies in the Thought and Writings
of Rabbi Joseph B. Soloveitchik

Edited by

EPHRAIM KANARFOGEL *and* DOV SCHWARTZ



THE MICHAEL SCHARF PUBLICATION TRUST
OF THE YESHIVA UNIVERSITY PRESS
NEW YORK

KTAV Publishing House

URIM PUBLICATIONS
Jerusalem • New York

Published with the assistance of the
NATALIE and ISIDOR FRIEDMAN Chair
in the Teaching of the Thought of Rabbi Joseph B. Soloveitchik
at Bar-Ilan University

In Memory of ISIDOR FRIEDMAN,
a Devoted Admirer of Rabbi Soloveitchik

Scholarly Man of Faith: Studies in the Thought and Writings
of Rabbi Joseph B. Soloveitchik

Edited by Ephraim Kanarfogel and Dov Schwartz
Editorial board: Ephraim Kanarfogel, Avi Sagi, Dov Schwartz,
David Shatz

Copyright © 2018 Yeshiva University Press

All rights reserved

No part of this book may be used or reproduced in any
manner whatsoever without written permission from the
copyright owner, except in the case of brief quotations
embodied in reviews and articles.

Typeset by Ariel Walden

Printed in Israel

First Edition

ISBN 9789655242812

KTAV Publishing House

527 Empire Boulevard

Brooklyn, NY 11225

www.ktav.com

Urim Publications

P.O. Box 52287,

Jerusalem 9152102

Israel

www.UrimPublications.com

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Kanarfogel, Ephraim, editor. | Schwartz, Dov, editor.
Title: Scholarly man of faith : studies in the thought and writings of Rabbi
Joseph B. Soloveitchik / edited by Ephraim Kanarfogel and Dov Schwartz.
Description: Brooklyn, NY : Urim Publications, [2018]
Identifiers: LCCN 2017058462 | ISBN 9789655242812 (hardcover : alk.
paper)
Subjects: LCSH: Soloveitchik, Joseph Dov—Teachings.
Classification: LCC BM755.S6144 S336 2018 | DDC 296.8/32092—dc23
LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2017058462>

CONTENTS

INTRODUCTION	7
SHALOM CARMY "In Many Respects God was Closer to Abraham than He was to Moses," Themes in <i>Emergence of Ethical Man</i>	11
SHIRA WEISS Biblical Hermeneutics in the Thought of R. Soloveitchik: A Preliminary Appraisal of the Influence of R. Yehudah Halevi	27
ALEX SZTUDEN The Identity of Love and Cognition in the Thought of R. Joseph Soloveitchik	49
EPHRAIM KANARFOGEL The History of the Tosafists and their Literary Corpus according to Rav Soloveitchik's Interpretations of the <i>Qinot</i> for <i>Tishah B'Av</i>	75
DANIEL RYNHOLD Science or Hermeneutics? Rav Soloveitchik's Scientific Method Revisited	109
DAVID SHATZ Contemporary Scholarship on Rabbi Soloveitchik's Thought: Where We Are, Where We Can Go	135
CONTRIBUTORS	197

INTRODUCTION

The intellectual and spiritual lives of Rav Yosef Dov Soloveitchik contain a series of seeming paradoxes. He was a great Torah giant whose views on Zionism did not accord with those of others of his stature; he was the great leader of modern Orthodoxy who saw himself mainly as a teacher, a *melammed*; his Torah presence in Israel was such that he was offered the position of Chief Rabbi, but he visited there only once, before the founding of the State; he was a virtuoso of Jewish philosophy who wished to be known principally through his talmudic teachings; and he was a prolific writer who did not publish many of his writings, due to the rigorous demands that he placed upon himself. Rav Soloveitchik did not subscribe to the remonstrations of Rabbenu Bahya ibn Paquda, “do not be overly cautious of the need for caution.”

With respect to his thought, many talmudists and academics have attempted to reveal the essence of his personality and his brilliance. A number have dealt with the role or weight of modernity in the thought of the Rav. Others have sought to elucidate the sources of the Rav’s thought. And still others have tried to clarify his system of ideas in order to discover consistent themes. The Rav, however, expressed his thought in a way that made it somewhat elusive. First, he employed a number of different writing styles. On occasion, such as in the essay *U-bikashtem mi-sham*, the Rav employed the accepted style for discussing religious phenomenology; in other instances, however, his presentation tended toward a more sermonic style, as in *The Lonely Man of Faith*. The doctoral dissertation that Rav Soloveitchik wrote on the thought of Hermann Cohen is highly technical and analytical, but it does not refer to a single one of Cohen’s “Jewish” writings.

Second, the Rav relied on an extensive and variegated series of thinkers and sources. An extreme example of this is his work on halakhic knowledge, *The Halakhic Mind*. The sheer range and density

of the sources makes it difficult to discern those that are most central. Finally, the Rav treated many significant issues without offering firm resolutions for at least some of them; two examples are his attitudes toward modernity and Zionism.

It is possible to suggest that the dynamism of the Rav's thought and the differing views that it embraces reflect the paradoxical nature of modern Orthodoxy as a whole. The intertwining of the intellectual freedom that characterizes modern thought on the one hand, and the unbending obligation to the requirements of the *halakhah* on the other, is itself a paradox, and it sheds much light on the search that modern Orthodoxy has undertaken. The influence of Rav Soloveitchik on modern Orthodoxy in North America is akin, in many ways, to the influence of Rav Kook on religious Zionism in Israel. Indeed, Rabbi Aharon Lichtenstein, the Rav's son-in-law, wrote: "The views of Rav Kook, with which the Rav agreed in many areas even as he strongly disagreed in some others, form a basis for comparison (in terms of the Rav's originality and breadth of ideas), even as the essential building blocks of their thought and the modes of their philosophical expression differed greatly" ("The Rav at Jubilee: an Appreciation," in *Leaves of Faith: the World of Jewish Learning* [Jersey City, N. J., 2003], vol. 1, 193).

In the past thirty years, the influence of the thought of Rav Soloveitchik on religious Zionism in Israel has increased, and the reason for that shift can be pinpointed. From the mid-1970s through the mid-1980s, religious Zionism in Israel became intertwined with the settlement of Yehuda and Shomron and Gaza. At that point, the philosophical writings of the Rav that deal so much with the alienation and existential loneliness endemic to modern man were not so influential. The strong sense of unity and purpose that permeated the religious Zionist camp did not allow for a deep understanding of the Rav's writings. However, from the late 1980s onward, in the face of social and political changes that affected religious Zionism, the Rav's writings were "re-discovered," and this time they spoke strongly to the young religious Zionist.

In recent years, modern Orthodoxy in North America has undergone a self-assessment as well. A number of rabbinic leaders decided to make 'aliyah,' and changes have also occurred at the flagship institution of modern Orthodoxy in North America, Yeshiva University. The

writings of the Rav, which express the considerations and concerns of modern Orthodox Jewry, have never been more relevant.

These parallel developments impelled us to organize a joint conference, under the auspices of both the Friedman Chair for Teaching the Thought of Rav Soloveitchik at Bar-Ilan University and Yeshiva University in New York, at which scholars would discuss the thoughts of the Rav. The two volumes that have emerged, in English and in Hebrew, bring the fruits of those conference proceedings to the reader. We hope and trust that these studies of the Rav's words and teachings will constitute a meaningful intellectual experience, and will also contribute to a further understanding of the complex challenges that stand before his students, and their students.

Ephraim Kanarfogel
Dov Schwartz

התוכן

- 9 אפרים קנרפוגל ודב שוורץ / מבוא לקריאה חדשה בהגותו של הרב יוסף דב סלובייצ'יק
- 11 דב שוורץ / תפילה כתודעה בהגותו של הרב יוסף דב סלובייצ'יק
- 43 דורית למברגר / ידע־עצמי וכינון־עצמי ב"צמיחתו של האדם האתי": טיבה הפרגמטי של הבחירה האינדיבידואלית
- 63 יעקב בלידשטיין / המוות בכתבי הרב י"ד סלובייצ'יק
- 73 שלמה זאב פיק / הגרי"ד סלובייצ'יק והקבלה
- 97 מנחם קלנר / הגרי"ד סלובייצ'יק ז"ל והרמב"ם
- 115 אבי שגיא / חידושה של הדתיות: האמונה כחוויה

מנהיגות רוחנית בדור תהפוכות

דמותו וכתביו של הרב יוסף דוב הלוי סלובייצ'יק

עורכים
אפרים קנרפוגל ודב שוורץ

אורים הוצאה לאור

הקתדרה ע"ש נטלי ואיזידור פרידמן להוראת משנת
הרב יוסף דוב סלובייצ'יק
באוניברסיטת בר אילן