

*In honor of Dr. Arthur Hyman,  
an outstanding Jewish scholar.*

## **The Siddur of Rabbi Jacob Emden: From Commentary to Code**

Jacob J. Schacter

One of the most interesting, complex and creative rabbinic figures of early modern times was Rabbi Jacob Emden (1698–1776). Reared in a learned home as the eldest son of Ḥakham Zevi Ashkenazi (d. 1718), a noted rabbi and respected Torah authority, Emden was a preeminent scholar whose achievement in the field of rabbinic literature was substantive and significant. He was a highly prolific author whose literary oeuvre contains works on all genres of rabbinic creativity: a commentary on the Bible, an extensive commentary on the six orders of the Mishnah and a separate volume on *Pirkei Avot*, a multi-volume commentary on the entire Talmud, a work devoted primarily to grammatical observations on the liturgy, a two-volume commentary on the first section of the fourteenth century *Arba'ah Turim* code of R. Jacob b. Asher, a commentary on part of Maimonides' twelfth century *Mishneh Torah* and on some of his more extensive letters, a code of Jewish law, a major ethical tract, hundreds of responsa, a number of sermons and eulogies, and several other monographs on a variety of subjects.<sup>1</sup>

One of Emden's most significant works was his commentary on the *Siddur*. He began composing this work in the Fall of 1744<sup>2</sup> and feverishly devoted himself to it for close to three years. The first volume (*Amudei Shamayim*) was completed on the first day of Hannukah 1746<sup>3</sup> and the second one (*Sha'arei Shamayim*) some eight months later, at the end of August 1747.<sup>4</sup> Although the enormous pressure Emden felt to complete this work forced him to abridge his remarks, delete various comments and prayers, and structure his presentation very differently than the four-fold division he had originally intended to use,<sup>5</sup> it remains an important contribution to the area of Jewish liturgy. It is also quite significant because it clearly reflects the diverse intellectual interests of its author. Emden the halakhist, exegete, mystic, liturgist, historian, grammarian and philologist all stand fully revealed in this highly influential and multifaceted work.

At the beginning of his introduction to the first volume of his commen-

## TORAH and WISDOM

tary, Emden presented three fundamental criteria essential for effective prayer. He found an allusion to this triad in a verse in *Deuteronomy* (30:14): "For the matter is very near to you, in your mouth (*bi fikha*), in your heart (*bi-levavkha*) so that you may carry it out (*la'asoto*)." For Emden, "*bi-fikha*" was a reference to the proper text and pronunciation of the liturgy, "*bi-levavkha*" referred to the correct interpretations of the prayers and the proper intentions (*kavannot*) they require and "*la'asoto*" reflected the appropriate normative behavior relating to ritual prayer. Having made his point by way of this novel exegetical twist, Emden proceeded to criticize earlier *Siddurim* which he claimed were found wanting in one or another of these areas. It was a desire to fill what he considered to be this lamentable void which motivated Emden to undertake the writing of a *Siddur* commentary. He claimed that his work would provide the correct liturgical text and vocalizations to facilitate proper pronunciation of the prayers while presenting appropriate textual interpretations, mystical prescriptions and relevant halakhic direction.<sup>6</sup> It is this last issue which is the focus of this essay.<sup>7</sup>

The presence of halakhic material in a commentary on the *Siddur* is nothing new; indeed, it is as old as the *Siddur* itself. The first work generally associated with this genre is the ninth century *Seder Rav 'Amram Gaon*. While it has been repeatedly noted that the exact composition of its original text is very difficult to determine, it is clear that it contained not only liturgical material but relevant nonnative halakhic rulings as well.<sup>8</sup> In fact, one scholar even went so far as to suggest that Rav Amram's *Seder* consisted originally only of the halakhot and did not include any liturgical selections at all.<sup>9</sup> Although rejected by later authorities,<sup>10</sup> this position underscores the centrality of this non-liturgical "most important part of the Siddur."<sup>11</sup>

The same is true about the *Siddur* of R. Saadya Gaon, written a century later, only more so.<sup>12</sup> It too contains halakhic material relevant to the liturgy but, in this case, expands its focus to include other halakhot as well, e.g. laws relating to the prohibitions of Shabbat, the dating of *Rosh Hodesh*, the search for *hamez* before *Pesah* and the baking of *mazot* for that holiday, the *shofar* sounds on *Rosh Hashanah*, the physical structure of the *sukkah*, a description of the *arba minim* taken on *Sukkot*, and the prohibitions and requirements of *Yom Kippur*.<sup>13</sup> Indeed, this dual focus of liturgy and law, whether directly related to the prayers or not, characterizes many prayer books composed during medieval and early modern times.<sup>14</sup>

However, while the confluence of liturgical selections and halakhic direction in *Siddur* commentaries is a commonplace, the centrality of the latter in Emden's two volume *Siddur* is unusual and virtually unprecedented. At

### *The Siddur of Rabbi Jacob Emden*

the very beginning of the first volume, Emden described this normative component of his work only in terms of laws relating directly to the prayers themselves.<sup>15</sup> Indeed, in the third part of his introduction relating to this halakhic or "*la'asoto*" element, Emden focused only on those laws relevant to prayer in general. He discussed the proper preparations necessary for prayer, the various physical movements and posture during prayer (e.g. articulating the words; standing, sitting or bowing; shaking back and forth; praying with one's eyes closed; praying aloud or softly; raising one's hands), decorum in the synagogue and the obligation to face in the direction of Jerusalem.<sup>16</sup> Indeed, he clearly stated at the end of the introduction:

And with reference to the laws, it was not my intention to transcribe from the *Shulhan 'Arukh* the details of the laws which are not substantially and primarily essential and relevant to the order of the prayers. My wrath is poured forth on those who confuse the order of the [legal] works and the manner of their study, who [simply] pour from one vessel to another inappropriate one and who lengthen the brief and shorten the long.<sup>17</sup>

In fact, throughout his work Emden included many laws and practices directly relevant to specific prayers.<sup>18</sup>

In the course of writing his commentary, however, Emden broadened this "*la'asoto*" component of it to include much, much more. He not only discussed all these liturgically-related laws but expanded his focus to include a great deal of legal as well as general information on a wide variety of subjects. For example, in the process of introducing the Grace After Meals, Emden launched into a long, elaborate discussion on all kinds of issues relating to food. He dealt with: the proper mystical intentions (*kavannot*) necessary while eating; various preparations that must be done before a meal, including moderate exercise to aid the digestive process; proper posture during the meal; when a person should eat; what types of foods are preferable, taking into account one's health, age, the climate, etc.; the order in which food should be eaten; the appropriate amounts of food; the relative merits of wine and water; the optimal emotional state while eating; the importance of sharing one's food with guests and the poor; selections from the *Zohar* to be recited during and after the meal; the *hamozi* blessing and, finally, everything relevant to the Grace After Meals itself--the cup of wine, *zimun*, those obligated to recite it, and more.<sup>19</sup> In fact, it is interesting to note that Emden himself sensed that he may have gone beyond the limits he originally set for himself and, at the conclusion of his presentation, apologized for its unexpected length. He noted that he elaborated on this matter because it deals with

## TORAH and WISDOM

important and complicated issues which require explanation on both a simple as well as mystical level.<sup>20</sup>

But Emden's expansiveness was not limited only to this case. Throughout his entire work, he engaged in a variety of excursions which dealt with a number of different subjects unrelated to the text of the liturgy. For example, after concluding his presentation of the *Ma'amadot* (selections from the Bible and Talmud to be recited daily), Emden discussed the importance of breakfast and which foods should be avoided in the morning.<sup>21</sup> Shortly afterwards he entered into a long discussion on the importance of being gainfully employed in a trade or business.<sup>22</sup> As part of his "*Seder ha-Yom*," Emden discussed the value of resting after eating and presented laws relating to the afternoon nap.<sup>23</sup> In a section entitled, "*Seder ha-Laylah*" after the *Ma'ariv* Prayer, Emden dealt with the requirement to recite one hundred blessings daily, described the general behavior of a person leading up to bedtime and prescribed what to do in case of a bad dream.<sup>24</sup>

Yet, even all of this does not do justice to the pivotal role of the "*la'asoto*" dimension of this book, the absolute centrality of which becomes even more strikingly apparent beginning with the section on the Sabbath, towards the end of the first volume.<sup>25</sup> From this point on, there is a subtle but very significant change in its entire orientation which will become clear from the following outline:

Heder I	Erev Shabbat	333b-337b	Laws & Customs
Heder II	Evening Prayers	337a-343a	Liturgical Text
Heder III	Friday night	343a-second 358a	
Part I	Meal (including some <i>zemirot</i> and <i>kiddush</i> )	343a-351b	Laws & Customs with Liturgical Text
Part II	Sexual Relations	351b-second 357b	
Perek 1	Why is Friday night the most appropriate time	351b-352a	Laws & Customs
Perek 2	How sex, in general, can either sanctify or desecrate the Divine Name	352a	Laws & Customs
Perek 3	If performed with	352a-b	Laws & Customs

*The Siddur of Rabbi Jacob Emden*

	the proper (i.e. kabbalistic) intentions, sex can be an exalting experience		
Perek 4	When sex is appropriate		
Helek 1	How often a month	352b-353b	Laws & Customs
Helek 2	How soon after a meal; which hour of the night	353b-354a	Laws & Customs
Perek 5	Proper diet necessary for healthy sex	354a-b	Laws & Customs
Perek 6	List of required <i>kavannot</i> during sex	354b-355b	Laws & Customs
Perek 7	The Sexual Act		
Hulya 1	When sexual relations are necessary	355b-356a	Laws & Customs
Hulya 2	How it is done (various positions, preparations, etc.)	356b-first 357a	Laws & Customs
Hulya 3	Other related issues	first 357a-second 357b	Laws & Customs
Part III	Other Laws Relevant to Friday night	second 357b-second 358a	Laws & Customs
Heder IV	Shabbat morning (including special prayers for <i>Shaharit</i> and <i>Musaf</i> )	second 358a-373a	Laws & Customs with Liturgical Text
Heder V	Sacrificial Ritual and <i>Ma'madot</i>	373a-398b	Laws & Customs
Heder VI	Shabbat Day Practices	389b-397b	
Kituniya 1	Meal (including some <i>zemirot</i> )	389b-391b	Laws & Customs
Kituniya 2	Torah study and other practices	391b-393b	Laws & Customs
Kituniya 3	<i>Minhah</i> service	393b-396b	Laws & Customs with Liturgical Text

*TORAH and WISDOM*

Kituniya 4	<i>Seudah Shlishit</i> (including some <i>zemirot</i> )	396b-397b	Laws & Customs
Heder VII	Saturday night	397b-408b	
Mehizah 1	Continuation of <i>Seudah Shlishit</i>	397b-398a	Laws & Customs
Mehizah 2	Evening service (including text of "ve-yiten lekha" and what to do if one forgot <i>Havdalah</i> in the <i>Amidah</i> )	398a-401b	Laws & Customs with Liturgical Text
Mehizah 3	Practices at home (including some <i>zemirot</i> ) and laws of <i>Havdalah</i>	401b-407b	Laws & Customs with Liturgical Text
Perek 1	General laws	403a-404a	Laws & Customs
Perek 2	Wine and cup	404a-b	Laws & Customs
Perek 3	<i>Besamim</i>	404b	Laws & Customs
Perek 4	<i>Ner</i>	404b-405a	Laws & Customs
Perek 6 <sup>26</sup>	Kabbalistic interpretation	405a-406a	Laws & Customs
Perek 7	Text and other Saturday night practices	406a-407b	Laws & Customs with Liturgical Text
Mehizah 4	<i>Melaveh Malkah</i>	407a-408b	Laws & Customs

It is clear that an important shift has taken place here. Until this point, the work was basically a prayer book, including a description of various laws and customs related either to prayer in general or to the liturgical text in particular, albeit sometimes remotely. When Emden felt that he deviated from this format, as was the case in his discussion regarding the Grace After Meals mentioned above, he offered an apology. After this point, however, the focus shifted dramatically. Instead of the point of departure being the liturgical text with the legal material being secondary to it, the opposite became the case. Emden was now concerned with presenting *all* of the legal and ritual practices relevant to the Sabbath and, hence, no apologies for non-liturgical digressions were necessary any longer. Since prayer is only one aspect of that day's ritual observance, it was treated accordingly by Emden. No longer did he present the laws of Shabbat prayer as an extension of his discussion of the liturgy but,

### *The Siddur of Rabbi Jacob Emden*

on the contrary, he presented the liturgy as only one aspect of its laws. In short, at this juncture the emphasis shifted from liturgy to law, the prayer book became a code and the "la- 'asoto" element of this work assumed center stage.

It is clear that Emden originally did not intend this work to be so halakhically all encompassing. As noted above, he explicitly stated in his introduction that "it was not my intention to transcribe from the *Shulhan 'Arukh* the details of the laws which are not substantially and primarily essential and relevant to the order of the prayers." Yet, in the course of his writing the book, he did precisely that and at the conclusion of its first volume described his achievement as being successfully able:

to set forth the ritual behavior of the Jew. The righteous shall live by his faith [cf. *Habakuk* 2:41] and his behavior in [fulfilling] the needs of his body and soul, when he arises and lies down on his bed, when he is at rest and is on route, his coming and going, in his Torah study, eating, drinking, sexual activity and other bodily needs and pleasures, in his involvement in business, trade and work, the norms [governing] his night and day, his weekday and Sabbath.<sup>27</sup>

This new orientation of Emden's continued into the second volume of his work as well. After discussing the laws and prayers associated with *Rosh Hodesh*. Emden launched into a detailed presentation of the ritual behavior associated with all the days of the year, with their special liturgies serving as just one component of the presentation. The following presentation of the structure of Nisan, the first month discussed, will serve as an example of this phenomenon which consistently recurs throughout the remainder of the work:

Mavo I	<i>Rosh Hodesh</i> Nisan 14b-15b	Laws & Customs
Mavuy II <sup>28</sup>	2-13 Nisan 15b-16a	Laws & Customs
Mavo III	Erev Pesah--14 Nisan 16a-22a	Laws & Customs
Delet 1	Night of Erev Pesah 16a-b	Laws & Customs
Delet 2	Day of Erev Pesah 16b-17a	Laws & Customs
Delet 3	Fast of First Born 17a	Laws & Customs
Delet 4	Afternoon of Erev Pesah 17a	Laws & Customs
Delet 5	Working on Erev Pesah 17a-b	Laws & Customs
Delet 6	Baking <i>Mazot</i> 17b-18a	Laws & Customs

**TORAH and WISDOM**

Delet 7	Description of the Pascal Sacrifice	18a-20b	Laws & Customs
Delet 8	Preparations for the Holiday	20b-22a	Laws & Customs
Ḥalon 1	Food preparations	20b-21a	Laws & Customs
Ḥalon 2	<i>Eruv Tavshilin</i>	21a-22a	Laws & Customs
Ḥalon 3	<i>Eruv Ḥazerot</i>	22a	Laws & Customs
Ḥalon 4	<i>Eruv Tehumin</i>	22a	Laws & Customs
Mavo IV	First Night of Pesah	22a-47b	
Delet 1	Prayers (including special text for <i>Ma'ariv 'Amidah</i> )	22a-23a	Liturgical Text
Netiv 1	Laws of <i>Hesebah</i>	23a-b	Laws & Customs
Netiv 2	Laws of Four Cups of Wine	23b	Laws & Customs
Netiv 3	<i>Kiddush</i>	23b-24b	Liturgical Text
Netiv 4	<i>Urḥaz</i> and <i>Karpas</i>	24b	Laws & Customs
Netiv 5	<i>Yahaz</i>	24b	Laws & Customs
Netiv 6	<i>Maggid</i> including text of Haggadah and commentary	24b-41b	Liturgical Text
Netiv 7	<i>Rahzah</i>	41b	Laws & Customs
Netiv 8	<i>Mazah</i>	41b	Laws & Customs
Netiv 9	<i>Marror</i>	41b-42a	Laws & Customs
Netiv 10	Practices at the Table until end of the Seder including text of the end of Haggadah	42a-47b	Laws & Customs with Liturgical Text
Mavo V	First Day of Pesah	47b-53a	
Shevil 1	<i>Shahavit</i> (the only printed prayers are the Thirteen Divine Attributes and " <i>Ribon ha-'Olamim</i> " prior to the Torah reading)	47b-48b	Laws & Customs with Liturgical Text
Shevil 2	<i>Musaf</i> (including special text for <i>Musaf 'Amidah</i> )	48b-50b	Liturgical Text



*The Siddur of Rabbi Jacob Emden*

Shevil 3	Temple <i>Musaf</i> Sacrifice	50b-51b	Laws & Customs
Shevil 4	<i>Simḥat Yom Tov</i>	51b-52b	Laws & Customs
Shevil 5	<i>Minḥah</i>	52b-53a	Laws & Customs
Mavuy VI	Secood Night of Pesah	53a-54a	
Meshual 1	' <i>Arvit</i>	53a	Laws & Customs
Meshual 2	Laws of <i>Sefirat ha-'Omer</i> (including text)	53a-54a	Laws & Customs with Liturgical Text
Meshual 3	Laws of <i>Kezirat ha-'Omer</i>	54a	Laws & Customs
Meshual 4	Practice of Jews in the Diaspora	54a	Laws & Customs
Mavuy VII	Second Day of Pesah	54b	
Mavuy VIII	<i>Hol Ha-Mo'ed</i>	54b-55b	
Mesilah 1	First Day, 17 Nisan	54b-55a	Laws & Customs
Mesilah 2	Second Day, 18 Nisan	55a-b	Laws & Customs
Mesilah 3	Third Day, 19 Nisan	55b	Laws & Customs
Mesilah 4	Fourth Day, 20 Nisan	55b	Laws & Customs
Mavuy IX	<i>Shabbat Hol</i> <i>Ha-Mo'ed</i>	55b	Laws & Customs
Mavuy X	Last Days of Pesah	56a-57a	Laws & Customs
Maslul 1	Seventh Day of Pesah	56a-b	
Maslul 2	<i>Aḥaron shel Pesah</i>	56b-57a	Laws & Customs
Mavuy XI	<i>Isru Hag</i> , 23 Nisan	57a	Laws & Customs
Mavuy XII	Rest of Month of Nisan	57a-58a	Laws & Customs

Further analysis needs to be done to determine Emden's codificatory methodology (i.e. his use of sources, citation of multiple opinions, references to other works, providing rationales for specific laws, etc.). It would also be interesting to speculate about what this shift of orientation reveals about Emden himself. Nevertheless, the fact is clear and is reflected, finally, in

## TORAH and WISDOM

Emden's own retrospective characterization of this work in his autobiography:

I included in it laws and customs that need to be known throughout the entire year, the order of the sacerdotal ritual which they practiced during the time of the Temple, all the events which occurred to our ancestors and the prophecies which the prophets foretold on any given day. Everything that is found in the Written and Oral Laws [the fulfillment of] which depends upon a given time, I presented in its place and on its day for each of the months of the year, even the appropriate hours [for the fulfillment of the] deeds for each day of the week on its day, and for that which applies to the nights of weekdays and holidays. All this I have set separately.<sup>29</sup> I did not confuse the matter of one day with that of another for all the days of the year. I explained, with the help of God, all the prayers, the blessings and the text of the supplications of the ancients. I interpreted [all] in accordance with *Pardes*, and they are corrected as best as I could. At first, the voluminous, long and wide work was very heavy in quantity and quality because I accepted upon myself to even cite the numbers of words in all the blessings and to provide for them blossoms and flowers<sup>30</sup> with beautiful allusions. I also presented in this work many pleasant, sweet and clear interpretations, aside from the simple approach, in different veises. Also, many wondrous and strange rabbinic statements were brought closer and more acceptable to the logical intelligence, with the help of God.<sup>31</sup>

Even here, the code aspect of the work takes precedence over the part which deals directly with the liturgy. The transition from commentary to code is complete.

## NOTES

1. For a full bibliography of Emden's works, published and unpublished, extant and lost, see Yizhak Rafael, "Kirvei Rabi Ya'akov Emden," *Areshet* 3 (1961):231-76. For more information about Emden in general, see my *Rabbi Jacob Emden: Life and Major Works* (diss., Harvard University, 1988).

2. See the bottom of the title page of *Amudei Shamayim* (the biblical reference there is to *Genesis* 28:17 which is read during the Fall); *ibid.*, 38b; J. Emden, *Zikkaron ba-Sefer: Ma'aseh "Amalek*, partially printed in Avraham Bick, "Rabbi Ya'akov Emden u-Millhamto bi-Sbulhanei Altona," *Tarbiz* 42 (1973):464; J. Emden, *Megillat Sefer*, ed. David Kahane (Warsaw, 1896), 167.

Other references to verses found in *Genesis* 28 are scattered throughout the introduction to *Amudei Shamayim*. See, for example, 1a (28:19), 4a, 38b (28:11-12), 38a (28:16).

3. See *Amudei Shamayim*, 418b. R. Ezekiel Kazenellenbogen's approbation to the *Siddur*, which Emden informs us (*Megillat Sefer*, 168) was requested after the volume was completed, is dated Rosh Hodesh Tevet 5507 (=December 14, 1746).

4. *Sha'arei Shamayim*, title page, 14b, 159a; *Megillat Sefer*, 169-70, 174.

Throughout this volume, Emden made some thirty explicit references to various practices during the years 5507-5508 (= 1747-1748). See, for example, *Sha'arei Shamayim* 15b: "this year it [i.e. the seventh of Nisan] is a Shabbat . . ."

5. See, for example, *Amudei Shamayim*, 36b-37a, 43a, 176a, 177b, 311a. See too J. Emden, *She'elat Yavez* II:17.

6. See *Amudei Shamayim*, 1b-2b. Emden's long introduction to this volume elaborates on these three themes: 4a-b discusses the liturgical text and its pronunciation, 4b-26a presents a discussion of the proper *kavannot* necessary during prayer as well as elucidations of the text and 26a-36a describes different normative practices relevant to prayer.

7. I have dealt with some of the other issues in my "Cultural Receptivity vs. Ethnic Pride in Early Modern Times: 'Hakham Zevi' Hirsch Ashkenazi and Rabbi Jacob Emden," *Ashkenaz: The German Jewish Heritage*, ed. Gertrude Hirschler (New York, 1988), 69-78 and in my introduction to a new forthcoming edition of Emden's *Luah Eresh*.

8. For the halakhot in *Seder Rav 'Amram Gaon*, see Y. N. Epstein, "Seder Rav 'Amram, Sidduro u-Mesadrav," *Ziyyunim* (Y. N. Simhoni Memorial Volume) (Berlin, 1929), 122-41; Louis Ginzberg, *Geonica* I (New York, 1909), 124-25, 144f; *idem.*, "Saadya's Siddur," *JQR* 33 (1942-1943):320-23; trans. as "Sidduro shel Rav Saadya Gaon," in L. Ginzberg, *Al Halakhah ve-Aggadah* (Tel Aviv, 1960), 174-76. See also Simljah Assaf, *Tekufat he-Geonim ve-Sifrutah* (Jerusalem, 1955), 182-84; J. Rosenthal, *le-Toledot ha-Siddur* (1945), 5; David Hedegard, *Seder R. Amram Gaon*, Part I (Lund, 1951) XX, XXVI-XXVIII.

For other discussions of the problematics of the original text, see Daniel Goldschmidt's review of D. Hedegard's edition, printed in his *Mehkarei Tefillah u-Piyyut* (Jerusalem, 1979), 407-12 and in Goldschmidt's introduction to his own edition of the *Seder Rav 'Amram Gaon* (Jerusalem, 1971), 7-22. For an early analysis of this issue, see Alexander Marx, "Untersuchungen zum Siddur des Gaon R. Amram," *JJIG* 5 (1907): 341f.

9. See Ismar Elbogen, *Der jüdische Gottesdienst in seiner geschichtlichen Entwicklung* (Leipzig, 1913), 359-60; trans. as *ha-Tefillah bi-Yisrael bi-Hipathutah*

## TORAH and WISDOM

*ha-Historit* (Tel Aviv, 1972), 269; 455, n. 15. Elbogen's conclusion, presented here in a tentative way, was more forcefully formulated in his "Prayer Books," *The Universal Jewish Encyclopedia* VIII (New York, 1942), 620.

10. See L. Ginzberg, "Saadia's Siddur," 321; S. Asaf, 184; D. Hedegard, XXVI-XXVII.

11. The quote is from L. Ginzberg, "Saadia's Siddur," 323.

Ginzberg also postulates that R. Hai Gaon wrote a prayer book which contained both the liturgical text as well as relevant halakhot. See his *Geonica* I, 175.

12. See Yisrael Davidson, Simhah Asaf, Yissachar Yoel, ed., *Siddur Rav Saadya Gaon* (Jerusalem, 1941). See also L. Ginzberg, "Saadia's Siddur," esp. pp. 324, 334, 363. Because the normative directives were written in Arabic, its impact on subsequent halakhic discussion was limited; see L. Ginzberg, "Saadia's Siddur," 343.

13. See *Siddur*, 116-18, 127-28, 131-34, 217-18, 232-37, 258. L. Ginzberg, "Saadia's Siddur," 328, exaggerates when he writes: "R. Amram was satisfied with giving comments upon the prayers, while Saadia's Siddur contains a digest of all the laws which a Rabbanitic Jew ought to know." Nevertheless, Saadya's inclusion of halakhic material not directly related to the liturgy is clear.

14. For the case of *Mahzor Vitry*, perhaps the most prominent example of this phenomenon in medieval times, see Israel Ta-Shema, "'al Kamah 'Inyanei Mahzor Vitry," *'Ale! Sefer* 11 (1984):81-89. For other examples, see Yisrael Zevi Feintuch, "Tanya Rabbati," *Sinai* 80 (1976):18-20; Amos Dodi, "ha-Hagayah ha-Mishtakefet me-Nikkudo shel Siddur ben ha-Me'ah ha-14," *Balsharut 'Ivrit Hafashit* 26 (1988) 17; Yehudah Razhabi, "'Iyyunim bi-Hitpathut Mahzor-Teman," *'Ale! Sefer* 9 (1981):99-114, esp. 112-14. See also J. Rosenthal, "le-Toledot ha-Siddur," 7f, *idem.*, "le-Toledot ha-Mahzor." *Mehkarim* II (Jerusalem, 1960), 633f, Avraham Grossman, *Hakmei Ashkenaz ha-Rishonim* (Jerusalem, 1981), 346-48.

For a striking example of a prayer book which contains a great deal of halakhic material not relevant to the liturgy at all (e.g. laws of mourning, childbirth, circumcision, *mezuzah*, *shehitah*, property), see Yosef Tobi, "The Siddur of Rabbi Shelomo ben Nathan of Sijilmassa," *Communautés juives des marges sahariennes du Maghreb*, ed. Michel Abitbol (Jerusalem, 1982), 407-25; *idem.*, "Sidduro shel R. Shlomo ben Natan mi-Sijilmassa—'Iyyunim Rishonim," *Yad le-Heman* (A. M. Habermann Memorial Volume) (Lod, 1983), 345-60.

Dr. Menahem Schmelzer informs me that many unpublished Italian *mahzorim* include halakhic material, primarily taken from the *Shibbolei ha-Leket*, while Sephardic *mahzorim* cite from the *Sefer ha-Manhig*.

A number of early eighteenth century printed Siddurim also contain halakhic directives. See, for example, *Tefillah Derekh Si'ah ha-Sadeh* (Berlin, 1713) by R. Azriel and his son R. Elijah of Vilna (e.g. what to do when forgetting to recite *ya'aleh ve-yavo* [27b]; when to recite *sim shalom/shalom rav* [29a]). R. Isaiah Horowitz, *Sha'ar ha-Shamayim* (Amsterdam, 1717) contains a great deal more halakhic material, but almost all of it is related to the liturgy. See also *Seder Tefillot mi-kol ha-Shanah* (Frankfurt, 1728), based on the *Seder Tefillah Derekh Yesharah* of R. Yehiel Mikhel Epstein.

This entire matter of normative halakhot being included in Siddur commentaries is a very interesting one which requires further analysis and clarification.

15. *'Amudei Shamayim* 1a, 2a.

16. *Ibid.*, 26a-36a.

17. *Ibid.*, 39b.

18. See, for example, *ibid.*, 82a-b (the prohibition of speaking between *barukh*

## *The Siddur of Rabbi Jacob Emden*

*she-amar* and *yishtabaf*, 118a (the time of day when it is proper to recite the *Shema*), 143a-b (the repetition of the *Shemoneh Esreh*, 144a-145b (a systematic presentation of the laws relating to the Priestly Blessing), 157a-158b (the laws dealing with *perisat Shema*), 158b-159a (laws governing the recital of *havinevu*), 159a-163a (the public Torah reading), 271b-273b (*tefillat ha-derekh*), 273b-274b (*birkhat ha-gomel*), 314a-315b and 319b-320a (the *Minhah* prayer), 320a-321a, 324b and 325a-b (*keriyat Shema* and *Ma'ariv*). He did, however, draw the line at some point and did not include all laws relating to prayer. See *ibid.*, 149b.

19. *Ibid.*, 275a-301a.

20. *Ibid.*, 310a-311a. Both at the beginning and end of this section (285a and 310a) Emden noted that he left out material which he felt was not appropriate for this work.

21. *Ibid.*, 262a-b.

22. *Ibid.*, 268a-271b; see also 195b-196b.

23. *Ibid.*, 313b-314a.

24. *Ibid.*, 326a-333a.

25. *Ibid.*, 333b-408b.

26. Perak 5 is missing. This is only one reflection, among many, of the great haste with which this work was printed. See my *Rabbi Jacob Emden*, 256-59, 307-08, n.16.

27. *'Amudei Shamayim*, 415a-b. See also *ibid.*, second 358a where Emden noted that "this work is thicker, many fold, from what I had originally intended."

28. For some reason, the text has "Mavuy" here instead of "Mavo." Emden later reverts to "Mavuy" with #5.

29. Cf. *Genesis* 21:29.

30. See *Shabbat* 145b.

31. *Megillat Sefer*, 167.

SHENGOLD PUBLISHERS, INC.  
New York

Edited by  
Ruth Link-Salinger

Essays in Honor of Arthur Hyman

Studies in Jewish Philosophy,  
Kabbalah, and Halacha

Torah ve-Hokhmah

תורה והלכה

WISDOM  
and  
T<sup>ORAH</sup>